

## CHAPTER EIGHT

### CASE STUDY SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS

*“Tourism ... should develop in an environmentally,  
economically and socially sustainable manner”  
(Simpson, 2008b, p. 239)*

#### 8.1 Introduction

This chapter provides recommendations related to case study specific issues that need to be addressed in order to improve the sustainability of the six investigated CBE ventures. Before the recommendations for each venture are given, the tourism offer and context as well as the governance and decision-making structures of each venture are briefly mentioned. The recommendations are discussed under common sub-headings as explained below:

- **Communication and liaison:** These recommendations refer to the communication channels and methods of liaison between the various stakeholders.
- **Training and development:** These recommendations relate to the training and skills development that staff and community members receive through the tourism venture. This may relate to specific tourism and hospitality skills as well as training in relation to nature and culture.
- **Community benefits:** These recommendations have a bearing on the provision of community benefits, infrastructure and services and the mitigation of any negative impacts of tourism on communities.
- **Tourism operation:** These recommendations refer to the operational issues that need to be addressed.
- **Tourism offer:** These recommendations refer to the service, accommodation, activities and attractions offered to tourists.
- **Tourist information:** The recommendations in this section deal with the information that is available to inform tourists in relation to the location, accommodation, activities and attractions associated with each CBE venture.
- **Resource management:** These recommendations refer to the management of natural resources, which include energy, water, waste, sewage and biodiversity.

## **8.2 Individually owned: Aba-Huab Campsite**

The Aba-Huab Campsite is a well run community campsite offering basic camping facilities in close proximity to a number of well known tourist attractions in north-western Namibia. This CBE venture is individually owned by Mr Elias A. Xoagub, a member of the local community. Mr Xoagub makes all decisions relating to the day-to-day management of the Aba-Huab Campsite. Decisions regarding the development of tourism in the area are taken by the Uibasen Conservancy, which has the rights to manage and derive benefit from natural resource utilization. The Uibasen Conservancy's membership consists of a number of community members of which Mr Xoagub is also a member. Community members living in the area who are not members of the Uibasen Conservancy have no decision-making rights or responsibilities.

This Campsite, which is the brainchild of an individual from the community, has been very successful, as it is the only tourism venture in the Twyfelfontein area that offers camping facilities. The Campsite was also the first tourism facility in the area around which a number of other tourism facilities have now developed through collective action taken by the Uibasen Conservancy. The newer tourism facilities have continuously 'poached' the best staff members from Aba-Huab, which has become a learning school for the staff now employed at the other lodges in the area. The development of other new tourism facilities has also led to the influx of many rural people into the area in search of employment in tourism. Since these new arrivals in the community are not members of the Uibasen Conservancy, they do not share in the benefits derived from tourism. The greatest challenge for the Uibasen Conservancy and Aba-Huab Campsite lies in the development of a unified, coherent community identity.

### **Communication and liaison**

- Open community meetings need to be held and, if possible, the Uibasen Conservancy should extend the membership of the Conservancy to the community members presently not included in order to restore the relationship between the Uibasen Conservancy, its members and the rest of the community now residing in the area.
- A transparent revenue distribution system needs to be implemented, whereby the revenues earned by the Uibasen Conservancy from the Aba-Huab Campsite and the other tourism ventures in the area are transparently distributed.

### **Training and development**

- A greater number of staff members and community members need to receive education and training through the tourism ventures and the Conservancy. This training should include aspects of hospitality, tourism, nature and culture.

### **Community benefits**

- The Aba-Huab Campsite, together with the Uibasen Conservancy, needs to invest more extensively in infrastructure and services for the community. In particular, additional sanitation, water provision, health care and education facilities need to be developed.

### **Tourism operation**

- The waterhole one kilometre to the west of the Campsite needs to be fixed and the grey-water waterhole needs to be closed as soon as possible, as this will prevent both wild animals and domestic livestock from entering the Campsite.
- The community members should be granted greater access to the Campsite. The access should, however, be controlled by a strict code of conduct dictating desirable behaviour.
- The grid electricity usage by the tourism venture needs to be recorded. The tourism venture's consumption of grid electricity could not be taken into account as it had not been recorded.

### **Tourism offer**

- Additional ablution facilities need to be built in the Campsite.
- The quality of the cuisine and the service provided needs to be improved.

### **Tourist information**

- Very little tourist information on the area and other tourism provision in the area is available to tourists. Additional information should be made available.

### **Resource management**

- The viability of alternative energy sources for water heating (such as solar energy) needs to be investigated and implemented.
- Measures for water saving and waste recycling need to be implemented.
- Staff and community members need to become involved in biodiversity conservation projects to ensure that the environment remains a draw-card for tourists.

## **8.3 Community-owned: Kaziikini Campsite and Shandreka Cultural Village**

The Kaziikini Campsite and Shandreka Cultural Village is a community campsite offering camping facilities and a limited number of built accommodation units as well as a cultural village experience. The CBE venture is situated on the main road to the Moremi Game Reserve and the permanently flooded areas of the Okavango Swamps in northern Botswana. This camp, together with the Santawani Lodge, is managed by an appointed Operations Manager in Maun on behalf of the Sankuyo Tshwaragano Management Trust (Sankuyo Trust). The Sankuyo Trust, which represents the people of the Sankuyo community, has been granted leasehold user rights to two Controlled Hunting Areas in northern Botswana. The management decisions of this CBE venture are taken by the Sankuyo Trust and implemented by the Operations Manager.

Kaziikini Campsite and Shandreka Cultural Village is a successful and sustainable CBE venture initiated by the community through the Sankuyo Trust. This venture has succeeded in creating a high level of training and skills development amongst both the staff and community members in the community. The Sankuyo Trust has made significant investments in the improvement of the lives of all the members of the Sankuyo community. Being a community-owned and -operated tourism venture, it has the potential to provide a unique cultural experience through the Shandreka Cultural Village. The cultural component of the tourism venture needs to be marketed and promoted more effectively so that the tourism venture may attract a greater number of visitors.

#### **Communication and liaison**

- A more effective communication system needs to be implemented to improve the communication between the Sankuyo Trust and the community. This will ensure that all the community members are more informed about the functioning and operation of the tourism venture.
- Better communication will also create a platform for community members to communicate their negative perceptions that tourism increases the price of local goods and causes people's behaviour to change. The communication system will also ensure that these concerns come to the attention of the Sankuyo Trust so that they may be addressed.

#### **Training and development**

- Training needs to be improved and centred on a succession plan to give the Batswana greater control over tourism in the future.
- Staff members need to receive specific training to empower them to manage undesirable behaviour of tourists.

#### **Tourism operation**

- A general code of conduct for guests needs to be compiled to control objectionable behaviour of guests.
- The management of the ablution facilities needs attention. The ablution facilities need to be cleaned and serviced more regularly. The possibility of providing solar lighting at the ablution facilities needs to be investigated.
- The French drain (sewage system) needs to be filled in and covered.

#### **Tourism offer**

- The standard of the service and the cuisine offered needs to be improved.
- The Campsite needs to diversify its offerings as visitors feel that a greater variety of experiences and activities should be available. Possible offerings could include guided game drives and walks in the immediate vicinity of the tourism venture.

**Tourist information**

- Better information on the tourism offerings and activities in the area need to be made available to tourists.
- Roadside signage needs to be upgraded.

**Resource management**

- Water use and water quality, especially with regard to sodium, need to be monitored.
- The size of the recyclable waste collection platform needs to be increased or the recyclable waste needs to be taken to Maun more regularly for recycling.

**8.4 Informal joint venture: Malealea Lodge and Pony-trekking Centre**

Malealea Lodge and the associated Pony-trekking centre offers accommodation and pony-trekking experiences in the highlands of Lesotho. This CBE venture is an informal joint venture between Mr Mike Jones, the owner of the Malealea Lodge, and the Pony-trekking Association of the Malealea community. Although Mr Jones manages the Malealea Lodge independently from the community, the major attraction of the Malealea Lodge is the pony-trekking. The pony-trekking component of this CBE venture is managed and controlled through an informal agreement between the 30 members of the Pony-trekking Association and the Malealea Lodge.

Malealea Lodge and the Pony-trekking centre have achieved excellent results in the investment in infrastructure and services in the Malealea community through the Malealea Development Trust (MDT). Every member of the entire Malealea community has benefited either directly or indirectly through the establishment of the tourism venture and the MDT. The most concerning threat to the long-term sustainability of the CBE venture lies in the unruly and problematic behaviour of the child guides who, through their ability to speak English, have become able to earn disproportionate incomes from tourism. This problem will only be resolved if all the stakeholders within the Malealea Community work together to find a solution.

**Communication and liaison**

- Better communication channels between the Lodge, the Pony-trekking Association and the community need to be created in order for all the community members to understand their interdependence and mutually beneficial co-existence.
- A transparent income distribution system needs to be established to ensure that the income earned from pony-trekking is distributed among the Lodge and the Pony-trekking Association members in a more transparent manner.

### **Training and development**

- Additional hospitality training is needed for staff members to improve the level of service provided to tourists.
- Training interventions for the pony-trekking guides need to be developed and implemented so that the guides may improve the experience offered to visitors on pony treks. Aspects such as language, nature and cultural interpretation, animal husbandry and guide training should be included in the training. Through training the pony-trekking guides will also become empowered to take greater responsibility for the co-ordination and control of the pony-trekking portion of the tourism venture.
- Nature and culture training also needs to be increased for the staff and community members so that they may be better equipped to conserve the natural and cultural environment, thereby enhancing the experiences of tourists to the area.

### **Community benefits**

- The teenage guides, who are the only English-speaking community members, have become unruly. This is as a result of the 'easy' money they obtain through guiding tourists through the village. This matter needs to be resolved through the collective effort of all the stakeholders within the community. An open discussion forum needs to be established where the entire community may come to an amicable resolution to this problem.

### **Tourism operation**

- The horses on which the pony-trekking segment of the tourism business is dependent need to receive better care to ensure the long-term sustainability of the tourism partnership. The horses should undergo regular health and wellness inspections. The nutrition and animal husbandry practices also need to be improved through educational programmes aimed at the horse owners.

### **Tourism offer**

- The level of service provided to tourists needs to be improved.

### **Tourist information**

- Roadside signage is in a bad state and needs to be upgraded or replaced.

### **Resource management**

- Negative environmental impacts of tourism such as erosion caused by quad bikes and motorcycles need to be controlled.
- Waste recycling and the use of alternative energy sources need to be investigated.

## **8.5 Formal joint venture: Damaraland Camp**

The Damaraland Camp offers fully inclusive high quality accommodation and experiences in the Damaraland Desert in north-western Namibia. The Damaraland Camp is a formal joint venture between Wilderness Safaris and the Torra Conservancy. The Torra Conservancy, which represents the people of the Bergsig-De Riet area, has the rights to manage and derive benefit from natural resource utilization of the area known as the Torra Conservancy. Wilderness Safaris pays an annual rental for the facilities and a 10% bed levy to the Torra Conservancy.

The Damaraland Camp has an excellent track record of high levels of sustainability in terms of the social, economic and environmental aspects of the venture. The venture has succeeded in establishing high levels of tourism service through a programme of intensive and professional training. The tourism venture and the Torra Conservancy also have a very good working relationship where the roles of both stakeholders are well spelt out. Economically the tourism venture is generating significant returns for both Wilderness Safaris and the Torra Conservancy, while the environmental performance of the tourism venture is exemplary. Although all the tourism accommodation units at the Camp are self-sufficient in terms of their energy needs, the same cannot be said for the operational portion of the enterprise, where large volumes of diesel and LPG – both non-renewable energy sources – are consumed. The consumption of these non-renewable energy sources needs to be reduced by utilizing renewable energy sources. In this regard additional solar energy could be generated. Damaraland Camp has an excellent opportunity to expand the community benefits derived from the tourism venture through the inclusion of cultural tourism attractions, experiences, crafts and souvenirs to its visitors.

### **Communication and liaison**

- A more transparent communication system has to be implemented to clear up any misconceptions community members may have with regard to the joint venture agreement. Any relevant concerns the community may have, could also be addressed in this way.

### **Community benefits**

- The Torra Conservancy should provide additional infrastructure and services and support to the De Riet village. Although this village is remote it should be included in future planning and development.
- Although tourism has brought about an increase in the crafts and cultural activities in the area, no crafts and souvenirs that have been produced by the community are sold at the Camp. The Camp should consider selling handicrafts and curios produced by the community. The sale of these crafts could also serve as an additional source of income for the community. In line with this the cultural offerings made available for tourists to enjoy

need to be expanded thereby also creating another means through which community members could derive benefits.

#### **Tourism operation**

- It is recommended that toilet facilities should be built at the parking area located at the Fonteinapos village.
- An investigation should be undertaken to determine whether the roads in the area need to be upgraded.
- Acoustic remediation needs to be implemented for the diesel-powered generator at the Lodge.

#### **Tourist information**

- A code of conduct for visitors entering the Torra Conservancy needs to be compiled and displayed on notice boards to control the activities of self-drive tourists. Aspects such as where visitors may drive and protocols relating to taking photographs of local community members and the use of firewood and water need to be addressed.
- The marketing materials of the Damaraland Camp should include more information on the community component of the venture.
- Information relating to the prevailing weather conditions that could be experienced at the tourism venture should also be disseminated to prospective tourists.

#### **Resource management**

- The Torra Conservancy Association needs to implement measures to minimize the impact of elephants on the crops and homesteads of communities. Some of the measures that have had some degree of success in rural Africa could be implemented (such as erecting electric fences or planting chillies around crops and homesteads to prevent damage by elephants).
- Although the camp has made great strides in the utilization of renewable energy sources, power sources other than diesel should be investigated and implemented. The replacement of the diesel generator with an alternative source of energy will significantly reduce the non-renewable energy consumption at the Camp. The possibility of linking the tourism venture to the electricity grid through the installation of an underground cable next to the underground water pipeline should also be investigated. If the diesel generators are replaced there will be an associated reduction in the noise levels at the Damaraland Camp which could also lead to an improved tourist experience.
- Water use within this desert context should be carefully monitored and the grey-water recycling system should be completed and implemented.
- Fluoride, nitrate and nitrite levels in the water should be continually monitored. If the high levels persist, remediation measures need to be implemented or alternative water sources need to be investigated. This is especially pertinent to drinking water supplies for human



consumption, particularly for staff and residents of the area who may have longer periods of exposure.

- Waste should be separated and recycled if possible.
- Although the Torra Conservancy is involved in biodiversity conservation projects, the staff and community members should become more involved in such projects to ensure that the pristine state of the environment is maintained and managed effectively.

## **8.6 Triple joint venture: Tembe Elephant Lodge**

Tembe Elephant Lodge, located in the Tembe Elephant Park in the north of the KwaZulu-Natal province of South Africa, offers fully inclusive accommodation in furnished tents. This CBE venture is a triple joint venture between a private entrepreneur, the Tembe community, and the Ezemvelo KwaZulu-Natal Wildlife Service (EKWS). Although the EKWS is not a shareholder in the venture it has significant inputs into the management and operations of the CBE venture, as the Lodge is located within a proclaimed conservation area that is managed by the EKWS. Decisions relating to the management and operations of the venture are made collectively by the private entrepreneur and representatives of the community. Daily management decisions are the responsibility of the Lodge Manager, who is a member of the Tembe community.

Through the establishment of the Tembe Lodge a number of employment opportunities have been created for the local community in an area where very few other employment opportunities exist. Tembe Lodge has, however, not fared very well in terms of the relationship between the Lodge and the local community. An extensive community engagement and communication programme involving the tourism venture, the conservation authority and the community has to be implemented in order to ensure participatory decision making in future. Once implemented the negative opinions, perceptions and misconceptions may be resolved.

### **Communication and liaison**

- There are significant mismatches between the perceptions of the staff and the community members with regard to the effects of tourism on the community. This indicates that large differences exist in the levels of understanding between staff and community members on what transpires in the Tembe Elephant Park and the Tembe Elephant Lodge. A clearer, more transparent channel of communication needs to be established between the Ezemvelo KwaZulu-Natal Wildlife Service (EKWS), the Lodge and the community. One of the recent challenges is that role players are at odds because certain areas may no longer be accessed because of tourism. It is the community members' perception that they are kept out of the Tembe Elephant Park, while both the Tembe Lodge staff and the EKWS

staff know that strict control is necessary because the lions that have been reintroduced to the Park now pose a significant threat to unescorted community members.

- The perception that most of the money spent by tourists does not stay in the community also needs to be addressed, as the community members feel that they are being exploited and that the largest portion of benefits are not accruing to them. There needs to be greater transparency regarding the distribution of the income generated by tourism to ensure that the community understands the system.

#### **Training and development**

- A comprehensive training and skills development plan needs to be implemented where staff and community members receive training. This training should include aspects of nature and culture as well as hospitality and tourism management. This plan will empower staff and community members to apply for and fill available positions within the tourism industry. It is also likely to assist in moving local community members up the hierarchy of available positions within the tourism venture.

#### **Community benefits**

- The Tembe Lodge, in association with its partners, the community and the conservation service need to make additional investments in services and infrastructure in the community. These could include water provision, clinics and schools.

#### **Tourism operation**

- Procedures need to be put in place to ensure that the Camp gates are closed at night to keep out lions, elephants and other large animals.
- The pricing of the 'bushcamp units' needs to be reviewed as guests have commented on the fact that the costs associated with the 'bushcamp units' in relation to the other accommodation offerings are too high.
- Codes of conduct for staff need to be developed in order to control undesirable behaviour of staff members. For instance, the noise levels made by the staff members should be kept to a minimum so that the tranquillity of the camp is maintained.

#### **Tourism offer**

- The activities offered to guests should be expanded to include game walks and birding walks.
- Additional roads, more accommodation and a greater number of wildlife species need to be introduced to improve the attractions offered by the Lodge.

#### **Tourist information**

- More information needs to be made available to visitors. These should include maps, brochures and wildlife species lists.

## **Resource management**

- Alternative energy sources should be investigated and where applicable employed in order to reduce the energy use at Tembe Elephant Lodge.
- The practice of dumping the waste from the Lodge on community land adjacent to the Tembe Elephant Park should be discontinued immediately. The waste removal from the Lodge should be synchronized with the waste removal of the EKWS, which disposes of its waste at a landfill site close to Manguzi town. Attempts should also be made to reduce and recycle the waste where possible.
- Staff and community members need to become more involved in biodiversity conservation projects to ensure that tourism does not destroy the very basis of CBE.

## **8.7 Organization operated: !Khoa ttu – San Culture and Education Centre**

The !Khoa ttu San Culture and Education Centre provides a unique insight into the culture and heritage of the San people of southern Africa. !Khoa ttu is located 70 kilometres north of Cape Town in the Western Cape province of South Africa. This CBE venture is managed by a Board of Trustees that represents the San people of southern Africa. The board members are elected representatives of the Working Group for Indigenous Minorities of Southern Africa (WIMSA) and UBUNTU (a Swiss philanthropic organization). The operations manager and the chief executive officer are also board members. The operations manager (a San person) and the chief executive officer (non-San) together manage the daily operations of this CBE venture.

!Khoa ttu, as a CBE venture, has succeeded in providing a unique tourist attraction on the West Coast of South Africa where tourists are exposed to the rich heritage of the San people of southern Africa. !Khoa ttu is also at the forefront of changing the misconception that the general public and tourists in particular have that all San people still 'run around in skins'. !Khoa ttu celebrates the present, past and future of the San people. In terms of sustainability, !Khoa ttu, as an education facility, has also made significant strides in offering numerous training programmes that have empowered San people (both past and present staff as well as community members) across southern Africa. !Khoa ttu has a very successful waste recycling and land rehabilitation programme that aims to reduce the environmental impacts of the tourism facility on the environment and to restore degraded agricultural land to a pristine state.

!Khoa ttu's greatest challenge for sustainability lies in the difficulty of bridging the large gap between the tourist venture and the San people in southern Africa. Additional means of communication between !Khoa ttu and the community have to be introduced to close this gap – possibly through the widespread distribution of a newsletter relating to the happenings at !Khoa ttu.

This could lead to the San people across southern Africa (the community in this instance) feeling more involved and informed.

#### **Communication and liaison**

- The difference in the perceptions of the staff and the community members with respect to matters such as the increases in prices and the changes in the behaviour of the community needs to be investigated. The reason for these differing perceptions needs to be found and resolved. The differing perceptions have been caused by the lack of communication between the tourism venture and the community members due to the geographically dispersed nature of the community and the tourism venture.

#### **Training and development**

- Training needs to be improved so that the staff and the community have a better understanding of tourism and consequently a greater awareness of the nature and benefits thereof. Once they are more aware they may be able to provide better tourism experiences and to identify the opportunities and benefits offered by the tourism industry.

#### **Community benefits**

- Once the CBE venture becomes independent of donor funding and generates profit, greater effort should be made by the tourism venture to provide additional benefits to the community. These additional benefits may be achieved through training and the provision of infrastructure and service, or through the establishment of small enterprises and businesses.

#### **Tourism operation**

- At present !Khwa ttu is an excellent day visitor facility with some overnight accommodation. If this venture would like to increase its overnight accommodation occupancies it would have to develop a plan for marketing !Khwa ttu as an overnight accommodation facility.
- The internal roads on the !Khwa ttu premises need to be upgraded.

#### **Tourism offer**

- Additional activities such as craft-making, storytelling, bow-and-arrow hunting and tracking should be offered as this will expand the number of activities and experiences available for tourists to enjoy.
- Traditional food should be served at the restaurant in addition to the already available à la carte menu.
- Additional en suite accommodation should be offered to cater for conference delegates and overnight visitors.

#### **Tourist information**

- As most of the visitors interviewed did not know about the availability of accommodation, it is clear that the accommodation should be better marketed in brochures and on the

website. The availability of accommodation should be included in roadside signage and marketing material.

- The times of the San guided tours should be advertised at the gates of the tourism venture.
- A meet-and-greet service should be available upon arrival at the main complex of the tourism venture to inform visitors of the available services and activities.

#### **Resource management**

- Although a great deal of rehabilitation and habitat restoration has already been done, continuous and renewed efforts should be made to control soil erosion and the spread of invader plant species.
- Alternative power sources such as solar power should be investigated for use in the main complex.
- The water consumption and the quality of the water need to be monitored continually. If the levels of sodium and chloride remain high over the medium term, remediation measures need to be implemented.

### **8.8 Summary**

This chapter has provided case study specific recommendations for the improvement of the sustainability of each CBE venture investigated. These recommendations should be implemented at the various CBE ventures in order to improve their sustainability performance. The implementation of these recommendations should however not be detrimental to the aspects and areas of the ventures that are already performing well.